United States Department of the Interior
National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places
Registration Form

NATIONAL HISTORIC LANDMARK

This form is for use in nominating or requesting determinations of eligibility for individual properties or districts. See instructions in Guidelines for Completing National Register Forms (National Register Bulletin 16). Complete each item by marking "x" in the appropriate box or by entering the requested information. If an item does not apply to the property being documented, enter "N/A" for "not applicable." For functions, styles, materials, and areas of significance, enter only the categories and subcategories listed in the instructions. For additional space use continuation sheets (Form 10-900A). Type all entries.

1. Name of Property

historic name: Old Main, Bethany College
other names/site number

2. Location

street & number: W.V. State Route 67
city, town: Bethany
state: West Virginia code: WV
county: Brooke code: 009
zip code: 26032

3. Classification

Ownership of Property: [x] private

Category of Property: [x] building(s)

district

site

structure

object

Number of Resources within Property

Contributing: 1 buildings

Noncontributing: sites structures objects Total

Number of contributing resources previously listed in the National Register 1

4. State/Federal Agency Certification

As the designated authority under the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966, as amended, I hereby certify that this nomination request for determination of eligibility meets the documentation standards for registering properties in the National Register of Historic Places and meets the procedural and professional requirements set forth in 36 CFR Part 60.

In my opinion, the property [x] meets [ ] does not meet the National Register criteria. [ ] See continuation sheet.

Signature of certifying official: ___________________________ Date: ____________

State or Federal agency and bureau: ___________________________

In my opinion, the property [ ] meets [x] does not meet the National Register criteria. [ ] See continuation sheet.

Signature of commenting or other official: ___________________________ Date: ____________

State or Federal agency and bureau: ___________________________

5. National Park Service Certification

I, hereby, certify that this property is:

[ ] entered in the National Register.

[ ] See continuation sheet.

[ ] determined eligible for the National Register. [ ] See continuation sheet.

[ ] determined not eligible for the National Register.

[ ] removed from the National Register.

[ ] other, (explain:)

Signature of the Keeper: ___________________________ Date of Action: ____________
SUMMARY

Old Main, a 420-foot-long red brick Gothic building, erected between 1858 and 1871, rests on the crest of the principal hill on the Bethany Campus, some 100 feet above the main street of the namesake town. The clock tower, which rises 140 feet from the center of the rear of the building, dominates the campus and the town and is visible for miles around.

The building consists of seven distinct sections, arranged symmetrically facing east-southeast along a single long axis, all the sections of the front facade being arranged in almost the same plane, but with the two end pavilions and the free-standing central clock tower projecting to the rear. The end sections, Commencement Hall and Oglebay Hall, are at the south and north ends, respectively. While the seven sections have distinctive massing and facade decoration, they are coordinated and balanced to appear as a unified whole.

All sections of the building date from the original period of construction except for Oglebay Hall, a 1911-12 replacement of the former Society Hall wing, which burned in 1879. Although there have been modifications of room use over the years, the general arrangement of the interior is largely intact. A continuous open arcaded corridor runs along the rear of the connecting sections at the first-floor level, passing beneath the tower. It links all seven elements of the complex building.

As conceived by architect James Keys Wilson with some suggestions by W.K. Pendleton, then vice-president of the college, the building contained practically every facility necessary in a 19th-century sectarian college: chapel, library, museum, laboratory, society halls, classrooms, offices, an assembly hall, janitors' quarters, and some student chambers. It was rather symbolically organized around the Bible. The chapel was immediately above the central entrance on the second level, and within it the Bible was kept on a pulpit, which was placed directly behind the bay window at the center of the front facade.

See continuation sheet
ADDITIONAL DESCRIPTION:

Facade Details of Note:

The main facade of Old Main presents an impressive appearance when it is approached up the hill from the town of Bethany. A driveway, situated on axis with the tower of Old Main, runs halfway up the hill and terminates in a gateway with a semicircular double stairway behind. This formal approach to Old Main was built in 1910. A sidewalk continues up the slope to the main entrance of the building. The immediate site is landscaped with large sugar maple trees near the top of the hill some 50 to 100 feet in front of the building.

The building's construction is predominantly of red brick with only a limited amount of explicitly Gothic detailing, mostly in stonework in its doorways, windows, finials, and capstones. The design shows the adaptation of the Gothic style from a type of construction relying on elaborately carved and fitted stone masonry to one relying on the massing of building blocks with relatively austere surfaces of brick—the material most readily available to this Ohio Valley college when Old Main was built. The brick, in fact, was burned on-site.

The building has six front entrances: one main central entrance on axis with the tower; one in the outermost bay of each 2-story connecting section; one at the center of each of the end sections; and one passageway between Oglebay Hall and the one-story connecting section adjoining it to the south. The central entrance is sheltered by a broad four-centered arch which opens upon a wide passageway to the main stairs in the tower at the rear. One-story, gable-roofed masonry porches shelter the entrances at the outside ends of the 2-story connecting sections and the center of Oglebay Hall and Commencement Hall.

There is one rear entrance, at the base of the tower, on line with the front entrance. Like the main front entrance, it is enclosed by a broad four-centered arch. There is also a secondary entrance into the north end of Oglebay Hall.

The arcade on the rear of Old Main consists of 17 four-centered arches. These had diamond-patterned wrought-iron railing at least as early as the 1890s.

Old Main's gray slate roof is divided into a series of gabled sections, with the ridge lines running north and south parallel to the long main axis, except for the roofs of Commencement Hall and Oglebay Hall, which are perpendicular to it, and the cross gables along the front elevation.
The grade slopes down about 16 feet between the north and south ends of the building so that a basement is inserted under all sections of the building south of the central tower section.

Central Tower Section:

The octagonal buttresses that flank the center bay of the main facade culminate in sandstone pinnacles. There are two front and two rear wooden dormers in the attic level, one of either side of the main cross gable. The central tower section, some 66 feet square in plan at the ground level, is divided into nine "cells" on the ground floor. These include two rectangular rooms on either side of the rectangular passageway at the front of the building, that to the north being the original and present office of the president of the college and that to the south formerly the president's reception room and now the dean's office; two square rooms on either side of the square stairhall forming the base of the tower at the rear of the building; and three thrown together without obstruction to form the long corridor's passageway at the rear.

The second floor contains only the square stairhall inside the tower at the rear and a single 58-foot by 41-foot room at the front, with a raised platform set into the 3-bay oriel window over the front entrance. This room may have been intended for use as a library, but from 1860 to 1925, it was used as the college chapel. In the recent restoration, portraits of figures associated with the founding of Bethany College and outstanding paintings of scenes of the Holy Land, by Edward Troye, have been rehung on the walls. The original stained glass panels in fixed sash in this room are also impressive.

The main tower, 22 feet square in plan, rises at the rear of the central section and is centered above the passageway between the main front and rear entrances. Its brick body rises 96 feet above the basement level. An octagonal brick turret, containing a winding stair, is attached to the southwest corner of the tower. This turret rises to an eaves line 124 feet above basement level. The tower cornice consists of a billeted molding of corbelled brick, with larger stone corbels carved with a ball-flower pattern. The tower has a steep truncated pyramidal roof rising 24 feet above the the eaves line. Each of the four roof slopes has a wooden dormer containing a clock face. A working clock was installed in 1904. Iron railings run around the perimeter of the pyramidal roof at its base and at its top. The octagonal turret is surmounted by a 10-foot openwork cone of iron rods and has a 13-foot iron weathervane at the top. Originally, terra cotta chimney pots were mounted on the slender brick pedestals at each corner of the base of the tower roof.
Connecting Sections:

Between the central section and the two end pavilions, the connecting sections, about 120 feet long, consist of 2-story units 67 feet long adjacent to the central section and 53-foot long 1-story sections adjacent to either end pavilion. The more northerly of the north connecting sections is two bays and contains classrooms; the adjacent 2-story unit, of four bays, also contains classrooms. The south 2-story and 1-story sections have 5 and 4 bays, respectively.

The first floors of the north and south connecting sections have a stairhall at the outermost end of the two-story connecting unit, running from the front entrances to the long rear corridor. The larger classrooms are the pair on either side of the stairhall. Smaller classrooms at the extreme ends of the connecting sections are entered from the long rear corridor.

A second-floor room (25 feet x 41 feet) in the north connecting unit, adjacent to the large central tower room, was used as a gallery after 1870. In the corresponding place in the south connecting unit is a room that was used as a natural history and ethnological museum in 1860-1911.

Commencement Hall:

Commencement Hall is a 55-foot high auditorium that has been used for college convocations and as the college chapel since an initial restoration in 1924. A further restoration in 1982-84 returned it more closely to its original 1871 appearance. Its exterior, at the extreme southern end, features a stair turret square in plan at ground level and octagonal in plan above the buttresses. The hall's roof is supported by eight attractive large wooden trusses, exposed on the interior. The window over the front entrance has five panels, culminating in decorated Gothic tracery. A three-part decorated Gothic rear window is also notable.

Oglebay Hall:

Oglebay Hall measuring 65 feet x 130 feet has an irregular floor plan, arranged around T-shaped hallway on both levels, with a secondary cross hall toward the rear on the stem of the T. The stem of the T adjoins the long rear corridor and contains the main staircase. The arms of the T lead to the classrooms at the rear of this section and, on the first floor, to the vaulted vestibule at the front.
CONSTRUCTION HISTORY:

Construction began in 1858, with a north, or Society Hall, section. By March 1859, the north connecting section and the central tower were being erected. The cornerstone of the southernmost unit (Commencement Hall) was ambitiously laid in 1860 and exterior work on the south connecting units was nearly complete late the next year when all construction was halted. This was occasioned by the outbreak of the Civil War, in which, Bethany, like the State of Virginia, was literally torn asunder. There were competing student militias, and while President Alexander Campbell stood with the Union and a nephew led in the formation of the new State of West Virginia, one of Campbell's sons joined the Confederates. Building did not resume in a major way until the spring of 1869, and was complete only in 1871 when the Commencement Hall portion was completed.

The Society Hall wing burned in 1879, and was not replaced until 1911-12. In the meantime, its cleared foundations remained visible. In 1911-12, Oglebay Hall, was built on the old Society Hall site, in a Tudor Gothic style generally compatible with, but on a different plan than, the original structure. The architect for the addition was Edward Bates Franzheim of Wheeling. Earl W. Oglebay, a Wheeling entrepreneur and philanthropist who was a Bethany graduate, donated the funds.

Commencement Hall went through several modifications. In 1890 it was converted into a gymnasium, and about 1900 its interior was remodeled for use as a 3-story dormitory. As modified, it served as a dormitory and barracks during the First World War, but was largely restored in 1924-26. In the rebuilding process, the original wooden tracery of its windows was replaced in stone. The present vestibule was added ca. 1924-26.

HISTORIC INTEGRITY:

Overall, the exterior integrity of Old Main to its period of construction is excellent, with exception of the Oglebay Hall addition of 1911-12. Given the modifications natural at any educational institution that grows or modifies its programs, interior integrity, except in the wings, is also quite high, except in those relatively minor instances described incidentally above. Minor interior alterations have been made, but the original floor plan is still in evidence.

Few interior wall partitions have been moved. Much of the building's original interior fabric remains, including doors, hardware, sash, door and window surrounds, and staircases. Fireplaces and mantels were removed
when steam heating was installed. The pine flooring in the classrooms and the second-floor chapel and exhibition room was replaced with hardwood in 1910; the wallpaper was also removed and the wall surfaces were replastered. The basement was remodeled in 1937. Its long rear-corridor floor was rebuilt and covered with quarry tile. The basement-level arches, beneath the corridor at the south end of the building were also filled in with glass brick.

PRESERVATION/RESTORATION:

In 1975, the firm of Grigg, Wood, and Browne prepared a master plan for the restoration of Old Main. This study identified a variety of measures that needed to be taken to insure the stability of the building and maintain its historic character, while keeping it in use for college purposes. In accordance with these recommendations, the college began an extensive campaign to restore the exterior and adapt the interior. Much of this work has been completed. The building appears in good condition and is excellently maintained.

Footnotes

1 The description of Old Main that appears here has been largely abstracted from historic and architectural information prepared by a Historic American Buildings Survey recording project that took place in 1976-81. Additional detail is available in that report. A selection of the measured drawings of Old Main prepared as part of that project has been appended to this nomination; they will be useful in reviewing this description.

8. Statement of Significance

Certifying official has considered the significance of this property in relation to other properties:

[X] nationally  [ ] statewide  [ ] locally


Criteria Considerations (Exceptions)  [ ] A  [ ] B  [ ] C  [ ] D  [ ] E  [ ] F  [ ] G

Areas of Significance (enter categories from instructions)

National Register:
ETHNIC HERITAGE/ EUROPEAN
RELIGION
ARCHITECTURE
National Historic Landmark:
ARCHITECTURE: Gothic Revival: XVI:E
AMERICAN WAYS OF LIFE: Ethnic Communities:
SCOTS-IRISH: XXX:E

Significant Person
Campbell, Alexander

Period of Significance
1858-1940

Significant Dates
1858
1911-12

Cultural Affiliation

Architect/Builder
Wilson, James Keys (main building)
Franzheim, Edward Bates (Oglebay H

State significance of property, and justify criteria, criteria considerations, and areas and periods of significance noted above.

SUMMARY

Bethany College, a small college situated in a rural area of West Virginia's northern Panhandle, has had an influence that belies its historically modest size, and is particularly vital in tracing the historical experiences of Americans of Scots-Irish descent. Bethany is the fountainhead of the ethnic religious and educational tradition that has led it to be described as the "mother" of over one hundred institutions of higher learning established in the United States by the Christian Church—long the Nation's largest indigenous religious movement—including such currently better known institutions as Texas Christian, Butler, and Drake Universities. These institutions and the movement from which they sprang collectively offer a powerful testimony to the manner in which the Scots-Irish and their main religious movement, the Christian Church (Disciples of Christ) seeded the advancing American frontier with educational institutions, in the process giving a vast impetus to the concept of comprehensive universal education, from primary school through college. Reformers like Alexander Campbell were central to this movement, for when he founded Bethany, free public high schools, let alone generally available higher education, scarcely existed anywhere in the United States.

Bethany College's principal building, Old Main, is a massive building for the small town in which it is situated. Constructed in 1858-71, it is the major historical educational building on the campus, and thus represents the college's historical role, but is just as notable as one of the Nation's earliest intact large-scale examples of collegiate Gothic architecture. Its primary architect, James Keys Wilson of Cincinnati, was the "Queen City's" leading architect in the period 1850-70. His later commissions included the Plum Street (Isaac M. Wise) Temple (a National Historic Landmark) and other works in Cincinnati.

[X] See continuation sheet
HISTORY

Bethany College was founded by Alexander Campbell (1788-1866), a Scots-Irish immigrant today best remembered, with his father Thomas, as principal founders of the Christian Church, or the Disciples of Christ (also long known as "Campbellites" in reference to them), but who was also a figure of note in 19th-century educational and political reform thought.

(Campbell's overall historical importance and other achievements will be considered through separate National Historic Landmark nomination of his long-term home, also on the Bethany campus. Nomination of that structure, currently undergoing restoration, will be made when the restoration is complete.)

When Bethany College was founded in 1840, there were only slightly more than a hundred colleges in the United States, and a mere ten in Virginia. College education was essentially available only to a privileged elite in the East. Indeed, even when West Virginia was carved out of Virginia in 1863, Bethany was still the only degree-granting institution in the new State. Even high school education was an attainment; there were few jurisdictions in the U.S. that supported free education beyond the primary level.

It is also notable that Campbell is associated with the Panhandle of West Virginia, for the area bears more than a passing resemblance to Scotland. This comparison relates to the people as well as the topography, for that part of the State, and much of the rest of Appalachia, was initially settled heavily by Campbell's Scots and Scots-Irish compatriots, among whom Campbell, a native of County Antrim, in Ulster, Northern Ireland, and a graduate of the University of Glasgow, found a congenial reception for his new ecumenically based brand of Protestant Christianity.

Scholars of the Disciples movement have commented on this strong ethnic basis for the denomination, noting that the "tincture of Scots-Irish ethnicity has endured as a staple of Disciples heritage," and, more importantly for this discussion, that: "Ethnically, Disciples were predominantly semi-literate, Scots-Irish frontier farmers. ... the broad base of the movement was a rural Scots-Irish underclass."³

Campbell's educational efforts related directly to these needs, because for a religious figure, Alexander Campbell was an eminently practical man. He noted in 1839: "We have a few educated intelligent men, as we have a few rich and powerful; but the majority are poor, ignorant and uneducated."⁴ Bethany was designed in major part to remedy this condition.
Founded in 1840, when Campbell was nearing the peak of his powers and influence, Bethany was his pioneering attempt to realize one of the four elements he saw essential to comprehensive education. He donated the land and the money, as he had for his earlier primary school, Buffalo Seminary, also in Bethany. Although a short-lived college in Kentucky was technically the first associated with the Disciples of Christ, Bethany is the oldest of their colleges that have survived to the present. It was a vital element in a quartet of institutions that would realize Campbell's ideal educational system. Campbell stated it thus:

In one word, the objects of this (may I call it?) liberal and comprehensive institution will be to model families, schools, colleges, and churches [emphasis in original] according to the divine pattern shown to us in the oracles of reason, of sound philosophy, and of divine schools, teachers of colleges, teachers of churches, preachers of the gospel, and good and useful citizens, or whatever the church or the state may afterwards choose to make of them.5

Campbell not only had a broad educational concept but very particular ideas about how an institution should operate. The setting for a college was vital to his concept. He described the ideal site in the Millenial Harbinger, his periodical, a few months before the college was established:

The location must be entirely rural—in the country, detached from external society, not convenient to any town or place of rendezvous [sic]—in the midst of forests, fields and gardens—salubrious air, pure water—diversified scenery, of hills and valleys, limpid brooks and meandering streams of rapid flowing waters.6

Campbell’s college, which reflected his democratic principles, was both oriented toward religion and infused with a curriculum that stressed applied science. In the latter respect, the college drew on the Scottish tradition that had influenced few eastern colleges, with the exception of Princeton.7 In its religious focus, the college was also exceptional. The Bible was to be a textbook—not just to be read at chapel, as in the Eastern colleges—and was, in fact, the focus of an academic department. This approach fit with the democratizing zeal of a religious leader who, as a classical scholar, used his knowledge of Greek to produce a plain-speech translation of the New Testament.

Bethany prospered and its influence, along with Campbell's, diffused in the next decades, as the Scots-Irish pushed out of Appalachia and helped drive the midwestern and southern frontiers across the Mississippi.
As they poured west to form a primary component of the settlement of the Mississippi Valley and the eastern slopes of the Rockies, Bethany graduates seeded their towns on the advancing frontier with Campbellite churches and new colleges in the mold of Bethany.8

In December 1857, the main building of Bethany was destroyed by fire. Campbell and his trustees undertook an extensive tour of Eastern cities in late 1857 and early 1858, with the notion of seeking models for rebuilding.9 When the trustees met with architects James Keys Wilson and William Walter in Cincinnati in January 1858 it appears they discussed buildings they had admired. The Smithsonian's basic plan, by James Renwick, a series of seven distinct functional units arranged along a single axis, was likely influential. It is also virtually certain, for reasons noted just below, that Renwick's alternative, and unbuilt, Gothic design for the Smithsonian, which bears a strong resemblance to Old Main, was available to the architects, if not to Campbell and the trustees.

In the Wilson–Keys firm, Alexander Campbell and the trustees of Bethany found the right architects to produce a Gothic-inspired design sympathetic to the models they had seen in the East. James Keys Wilson, born in 1828, studied drawing in Philadelphia and architecture in New York, in the offices of Martin Thompson and James Renwick. Wilson had then worked with Renwick, the designer of Grace Church in New York and the Smithsonian Institution, in 1845–47. After traveling in Europe, he settled in Cincinnati in 1848, where he entered partnership with William Walter, an older architect. Old Main was the most important building of the firm during their partnership, and was likely largely Wilson's work, because his training had occurred during the increasing vogue of the Gothic style.

As Campbell observed at the laying of the cornerstone, on May 31, 1858:

The Gothic has been adopted as the style most fitly expressive of the aspiring nature of the Christian's aims and hopes, and every care is being taken to adapt the plans and proportions to the present wants and growing prospects of Bethany College.10

The college's then-vice-president, W.K. Pendleton, a graduate of the University of Virginia, likely suggested to Wilson the long arcade along the back of the building. He was also likely responsible for directions to the architect to make the building as fireproof as possible. The firewalls inserted in the building permitted it to survive the 1879 fire with the loss of only one of its seven component units.
The fortunate fireproofing and Bethany's somewhat secluded rural location have helped it escape the fate that a number of other early Gothic college buildings constructed in its era encountered. Among those lost except in renderings and photographs are those at New York University (1833-37) (demolished in 1911); Gore Hall, at Harvard (1838, demolished in 1913); and Princeton's Lenox Library (1842, demolished in 1955).

Some early college buildings, in the Gothic style, such as Old Kenyon, at Kenyon College, Gambier, Ohio (1827-29, burned and rebuilt in 1949); Ascension Hall (begun in 1857), at the same institution; the Virginia Military Institute (begun in 1851); Old Main at Knox College, Illinois (1856-57) [a National Historic Landmark as the only extant site of a Lincoln-Douglas debate]; and Dwight Hall, at Yale (1842-46) do survive, but none surpass Old Main in size and historic integrity.

CONCLUSION

Old Main has stood on Mount Lavinium overlooking the college and village of Bethany for better than a century now, fulfilling the aims the founder outlined for her. Her roster of graduates is impressive for so small a school. Their role in the history of the State has been phenomenal, if not dominant, including key figures in the achievement of Statehood itself, and has been highly respectable even when judged nationally. Speaker of the House "Champ" Clark and Supreme Court Justice Joseph B. Lamar are just two who can be mentioned, as well as numerous educators, doctors, and prominent leaders of the Disciples.

Bethany College's Old Main, then, has been an object of pilgrimage not only for Disciples of Christ, to whom it may be described as more a religious than secular shrine, but also for others who have sought to appeal to Campbell's flock and to the residents of his State. Several Presidents and future Presidents have journeyed here, including James A. Garfield, himself a Disciple who served as president of Hiram College, in Ohio, another Disciples college; Lyndon B. Johnson, also a Disciple; and John F. Kennedy.

The most historically interesting of these visits is that of John F. Kennedy, who spoke in Commencement Hall during his decisive West Virginia Presidential primary campaign in 1960. In this appearance, at a Protestant college in America's most Protestant State, America's future first Catholic President confronted, literally and figuratively, the religious issue, and, as he would elsewhere during his campaign, drew a distinction between the responsibilities of a public official and a person's private religious practice. It was a speech that Campbell, a cleric who served in political posts and debated public policy, as well as religion, would likely have appreciated.
Footnotes

1 Portions of this discussion reflect historical material appearing in the HABS historical treatment referenced in Footnote 1 of the Description section of this study.


3 Ibid., p. 15, 16.

4 Cited in Ibid., p. 15.


6 *Millennial Harbinger*, 1840, p. 449.

7 Olbricht, *op. cit.*, pp. 90-94.

8 These institutions are cataloged and discussed in Cummins, *op. cit.*

9 *Millennial Harbinger*, 5th Series, I, 3 (March 1858): 159; and I, 5 (May 1858): 248-249.


9. Major Bibliographical References

Previous documentation on file (NPS):

☐ preliminary determination of individual listing (36 CFR 67) has been requested
☐ previously listed in the National Register
☒ previously determined eligible by the National Register
☐ designated a National Historic Landmark
☐ recorded by Historic American Buildings Survey # WV-118
☐ recorded by Historic American Engineering Record #

See continuation sheet

Primary location of additional data:

☐ State historic preservation office
☐ Other State agency
☒ Federal agency
☐ Local government
☒ University
☐ Other

Specify repository:
Bethany College Archives

10. Geographical Data

Acreage of property Less than 1

UTM References

Zone
Easting
Northing

See continuation sheet

Verbal Boundary Description

See continuation sheet

Boundary Justification

See continuation sheet

11. Form Prepared By

name/title James H. Charleton
organization History Division, NPS
street & number 1100 L St., NW
city or town Washington
date February 1, 1990
telephone (202) 343-8165
state DC zip code 20013